

Minutes of the MNAA
Diversity and Workforce Committee



Date: February 13, 2019 Place: Nashville International Airport Board Room
Nashville, Tennessee
Time: 10:30 a.m.
Committee Members Present: Christy Smith, Chair; Matt Wiltshire, Vice Chair, A.
Dexter Samuels; John Doerge
Committee Members Absent: Trey Harwell
Others Present: Doug Kreulen; Cindy Barnett; Jimmy Granbery

Call to Order

Chair Smith called the meeting of the Diversity and Workforce Development (DWD) Committee to order on February 13, 2019, at 10:30 a.m., pursuant to Public Notice dated February 8, 2019.

II. Approval of Minutes

Chair Smith called for approval of the Minutes of the November 7, 2018, Diversity Committee Meeting. A motion was made by Mayor's Representative Wiltshire and seconded by Commissioner Doerge. The motion carried by vote of 4 to 0.

III. Chair's Report

Chair Smith had no Chair's Report.

IV. Items for Approval

None.

V. Information Items

A. 2019 Affirmative Action Plan Update

Ms. Karisse Spray, AVP, Human Resources, introduced Joshua T. Wood, Esq., Associate at Waller Lansden Dortch & Davis, LLP and gave a brief bio of Mr. Wood. Mr. Wood stated he had been

working with MNAA on the 2019 Affirmative Action Plan (AAP). Mr. Wood explained that an AAP is a federally mandated plan that certain government entities and companies that contract with the federal government each year are required to perform. AAP is a “Management Tool” designed to ensure Equal Opportunity to all demographics in the community. It is common to analyze the previous year’s data, in this case 2018, to determine efforts, goals, and initiatives for 2019 using the standard of “Good Faith Effort” in meeting the obligations.

Mr. Wood discussed the major components of an AAP as follows:

- Organizational Profile - Workforce Analysis
- Job Group Analysis
- Availability Analysis
- Annual Placement Goals
- Designation of Responsibility
- Problem Area Analysis
- Action-Oriented Programs
- Internal Audit & Reporting System

Mr. Wood then reported on a couple of MNAA’s tests. The first test was the Availability Analysis and the Annual Placement Goals. This tests the census data within the community and determines whether or not the workforce is reflective of that. For this year, MNAA had one Placement Goal and that was Women in Job Group 060 (Craft Workers). Mr. Wood expressed to the Board that MNAA does a great job of going deep into the data and trying to determine the cause of the disparity. The AAP team goes to the application logs and promotion logs and look to see how many women actually applied for Job Group 060 (Craft Workers). The results were benign as far as the number of women who applied to be Craft Workers and the availability for the community. The APP are going off 2010 census data so it is a little stale now. In 2020 the new data will happen. Good faith efforts are fine.

The second test Mr. Wood wanted to touch on was Problem Areas for MNAA in 2019. This test looks at hires, terminations, promotions and compensation. There were no problems with any of these areas but initially had some hits that MNAA had to delve deeper into. MNAA had initially received a number saying there were certain job titles where women and minorities were making less than their counterparts with the same job title. MNAA immediately looked to the data to determine the cause of that disparity to make sure discrimination wasn’t a factor,

intentional or unintentional. MNAA conducted a targeted analysis and determined all of the disparities there were things like tenure, experience, education, etc. These are lawful, non-discriminatory reasons. There were some job titles that had disparity but they were all benign, with lawful reasons for those disparities. MNAA also looked at the data as compared to the compensation analysis that was conducted in December. In November, the Board approved around \$200,000 in compensation adjustments. Those adjustments were not included in this year's data because we look back to 2018. This is certainly good faith efforts to make sure to comply with minorities and women being paid on parity and no discrimination is occurring. Those changes will be reflected in next year's plan.

Mayor's Representative Wiltshire asked if there were specifics that MNAA needs to be focused on. Mr. Wood stated that being vigilant about the Affirmative Action efforts is important, such as recruiting, retaining, and promoting diverse candidates and minority candidates.

Commissioner Smith asked Mr. Wood how long he had worked with MNAA and their AAP. Mr. Wood stated he started working 3 or 4 years ago and commented that Chandra Starks and Karisse Spray had done an awesome job.

Ms. Spray thanked Mr. Woods for his work to help get the AAP turned around very quickly.

This item was presented for information purposes only with no action required.

B. Diversity & WF Development Update

Ms. Spray gave an update on Diversity and Workplace Development, specifically the EEO Quarterly Report and talent acquisition update.

The Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) report is reviewed quarterly against the American Community Survey (ACS) Labor Force for Nashville MSA. Our racial diversity is reflective of the Nashville MSA. Gender diversity challenges have been present in the non-exempt classification.

FY19 2nd Quarter EEO Summary

1. Based on MNAA's regular full-time and part-time workforce
 - 297 as of December 31, 2018
2. Data compared to the 2017 American Community Survey (ACS) Census Labor Force
 - Nashville MSA Data

3. Nashville Davidson County MSA is comprised of fourteen (14) counties: Cannon, Cheatham, Davidson, Dickson, Hickman, Macon, Maury, Robertson, Rutherford, Smith, Sumner, Trousdale, Williamson and Wilson
4. MNAA’s workforce displayed by gender, race, Fair Standard Labor Act (FSLA) exemption and supervisory status

Racial Diversity

Race	2017 ACS Census	MNAA FY19-Q1	MNAA FY19-Q2
White	78.6%	75.8%	76.4%
Black	15.4%	19.1%	18.5%
Other	6%	5.1%	5.1%

Gender Diversity

Gender	2017 ACS Census	MNAA FY19-Q1*	MNAA FY19-Q2*
Male	52.2%	71.3%	71.4%
Female	47.8%	28.7%	28.6%

**Difference is predominantly shown in the non-exempt classification*

Ms. Spray discussed different ways MNAA is trying to acquire talent such as:

- A. Expanding local high school partnerships
 - McGavock High School
 - Cane Ridge High School
 - Glenclyff High School
 - Overton High School
 - Maplewood High School
 - Antioch High School
- B. Developing Maintenance Apprenticeship Program (skilled trades)
 - Tennessee Board of Regents
 - Tennessee College of Applied Technology (TCAT)
 - Urban League
 - Empower the Journey – Knowledge Academy
- C. Partnering with Nashville State Community College for public safety (law enforcement) jobs

D. Developed Internship Program Policy

- Internship Policy developed to better partner with local schools and universities in the middle Tennessee area
- In final review

E. Partnering with Nashville Area Chamber of Commerce's Tennessee Reconnect Program

- Ambassador Training
- Effectively communicate and access opportunities for employees interested in pursuing post-secondary education

F. Other Activities

- Tennessee State University Fall Career Fair
- TN Career Guide
- Nashville Workforce Network
- The Power of We Diversity Conference
- Williamson County Chamber of Commerce – Inclusion & Diversity Luncheon
- Nashville Maker Community

Ms. Spray also reported there is a "Save the Date" coming in regard to an Open House to showcase Maintenance trades (Academies, Recruitment Agencies).

Commissioner Doerge stated the apprenticeship program that the Greater Nashville Technology Counsel just launched may have some "lessons learned" from their program. He stated he could connect them with Ms. Spray.

Commissioner Granbery asked what the differences in qualifications of a Metro Police Officer and an airport police officer are. Ms. Spray stated there is no difference. MNAA sends its officers through the same post certification training as the Metro officers. MNAA's officers are required to be 21 years old just as Metro and MNAA requires at least an associate degree or 16 credit hours or military service.

Mr. Kreulen stated that all the officers go through the same state mandated requirements and that the bar is actually higher on MNAA's part because of the associate degree. MNAA's officers are more customer oriented and our officers know that when they finish their police certification MNAA sends them to fire certification and then to also encourage them to get their EMT license because they get paid more money for that. Most of our officers are police, fire and EMTs.

Commissioner Granbery asked the radius of how far MNAA goes to recruit. Ms. Spray stated we are in the local, middle Tennessee area but MNAA definitely plans to expand as the recruiting needs dictate. MNAA is not opposed to reaching out across the state to get qualified candidates. Ms. Spray also stated that a benefit to being hired as an officer here is that our hiring process is a little quicker than Metro. It usually takes Metro about six months and it takes MNAA 2-3 months after the job is posted. Mr. Kreulen stated that compensation was a major factor for losing quality candidates, however, the compensation study has allowed MNAA to offer more competitive salaries, combined with our benefits (health and retirement), MNAA offers a great package. Ms. Spray confirmed MNAA conducted 25 interviews last week for police officers.

Chair Samuels asked to go back to the second quarter EEO analysis and inquired about the disparity of males to females in frontline managers and supervisors. He asked for an expectation in terms of percentages in relation to disparity. Ms. Spray reported that the majority of the supervisors are going to be in MNAA's two largest parts of business, maintenance and department of safety. There was a goal for females in craft workers which is under maintenance. MNAA also understands that there is still the need to further diversify the police officer positions as well. Chair Samuels asked if the AAP spoke to that disparity in the police officer reference. Mr. Woods informed the Board that the Availability Analysis of the AAP would have divided the police officers into a job group. There are no percentages that must be met for AAP purposes. Mr. Woods stated that if MNAA wanted to state a percentage internally, it could. Mr. Wood stated there is no bright line percentage for women or minorities that need to be present within a particular job group.

Commissioner Smith stated the area of concern for her is the "other" category. Ms. Smith praised the HR department for their efforts in the Asian and Latino communities to showcase what MNAA has and those are areas she would like to continue to see MNAA move forward on growth in that category as well. Ms. Spray stated that while MNAA is doing "ok" there is still work to be done and MNAA would like to do better. Commissioner Smith stated that HR has already come a great distance in the time that she has been on the Board and she appreciates all the efforts.

Ms. Spray then introduced Ms. Chandra Starks and Ms. Amanda Potts. They have been recently promoted to HR Managers and have been in the business a very long time.

This item was presented for information purposes only with no action required.

C. Disparity Study Update

Ms. Donzaleigh Powell, Director, Business Diversity Development, presented information items on Diversity and Workforce Development Update, Disparity Study Update and our goal setting methodology.

Ms. Powell started with an update on the Diverse Business EXPO that MNAA hosted back in November of 2018. This event was meant to provide opportunity for departments, particularly staff that have day to day buying power to be able to meet and learn about professional services and goods and services firms. There were 20 firms that participated with a wide variety in the scopes such as geo-technical survey, office supplies, recruiting, and janitorial, just to name a few. MNAA sent out surveys to firms that participated as a vendor, as well as to the staff that participated at MNAA. Seven survey responses were received from the vendors out of the 20, almost all stated that they had reached back out to attendees that attended their booth and felt there was adequate attendance and all responded it was well worth their time. 45 MNAA staff attended the event and 14 contractors. Out of the 45 staff members, 12 completed the survey, based on the responses a little under half currently were already utilizing the MNAA directory. All said they were able to make meaningful connections. They did like the flexible drop-in based on their availability within the 2-hour window. There were several that asked for additional advance notice to avoid schedule conflicts. There were a couple that suggested adding construction companies in goods, services, and professional services. Several attendees that were already ordering from SMWBE firms, some mentioned they would consider the ones that they actually met in person. MNAA is continuing to receive feedback on the contracts. For instance, MNAA's HR department was able to coordinate with one of the recruiting firms that was on location to assist with the finance department in an opportunity that they had. That position was filled and one contract that was done. The Business Development Diversity Department has added another SMWBE firm they will utilize. JWN is looking to work with SMWBE firms for design and engineering in order to help with upcoming projects.

Ms. Powell stated MNAA has been working with Hensel Phelps beginning on Project One to ensure they are educating, cultivating, and providing employment opportunities to the Nashville and the surrounding areas. MNAA has developed strong partnerships in the community in order to provide exposure to the construction industry to those within the certain zones and high schools.

Hensel Phelps has partnerships with:

- If I Had A Hammer – Hammer Build Event
- Goodwill Career Solutions
- 4:13 Strong
- Empower the Journey

Local Hiring Status on D Concourse Project

- 3 local hires to date through 2018
- 23 additional committed hires to be made in 2019
- More committed hires to come per remaining 20+ scopes to be purchased

Ms. Powell reminded the Board of the Business Taking Off event that will be held on March 22, 2019 at the Airport Marriott from 7:30 a.m. to 11:30 a.m. This is the first year MNAA will be including our contractors from Projects 1, 2, and 3 in the upcoming project presentation.

Ms. Powell updated the Board on the MNAA Disparity Study Update. The kickoff meeting with Griffin & Strong, PLLC (G&S) was conducted back in December 2018. A data assessment plan was created, conference calls are continuing on a monthly basis and G&S are performing their legal and policy review. G&S hosted their first informational meeting on February 12, 2019 which is designed to provide an opportunity for the public to hear about what the disparity study is, provide information on the process they will be undergoing, and allow attendees to provide anecdotal information about their experiences, working or attempting to work with the airport. 80 people registered and 35 attended.

Mr. Kreulen inquired as to how the invitations are being sent to the community. Ms. Powell stated that G&S is responsible for sending out the invitations. Mr. Kreulen then asked if the Committee or the Commission as a whole might want to be added to that so that everyone knows the meetings are going on. Mr. Kreulen stated that MNAA would want to add the executive team to make sure we are all getting the same e-mails as to what is happening. Ms. Powell stated the BDD chose not to attend so that people in the community could fully voice their opinions without discrimination of future employment with MNAA.

D. Goal Setting Methodology Review (Chair Samuels)

Ms. Powell reviewed the goal setting methodology as follows:

1. Define areas of work for the services required for the project, by NAICS Code
2. Determine availability for the type of services needed for the project
 - Relative Availability - Number of minority and women-owned firms

- Total Availability – Number of firms from the universe, via Census/ American FactFinder
- 3. Calculate weighted relative availability
 - Based on percentage of scope of services for total project
- 4. Optional Baseline Goal Adjustment - Adjust the baseline goal to reflect specific additional factors, such as
 - Assessment of current capacity and past historical MWBE participation rates for similar activities/projects
 - Statistical disparities between availability and utilization of MWBE firms

Ms. Powell reported that the split is based on the current disparity study. Once MNAA has a new one completed in December, there will be different numbers based on that calculation.

Chair Samuels asked who approves the goals once the recommendations are set by BDD. Mr. Kreulen stated once BDD sets the goal, that is the calculation and results are based on good faith effort.

Commissioner Smith inquired as to this methodology being MNAA's proprietary methodology. Ms. Powell stated this methodology was standard.

VI. Adjourn

There being no further business, Chair Smith declared the meeting adjourned at 11:21 a.m.


Amanda C. Farnsworth, Board Secretary